

---

# SOME PROBLEM OF QUANTITY IN CERTAIN INDIAN LANGUAGES

E. M. WHITLEY

## DISCUSSION

*Lüdtke*

As Mrs. Whitley has succeeded in showing, the relation between [a] and [a] is exactly on the same level as that between [a] and [a:]. This statement is, of course, not in keeping with classical phonemic theory. However, the distinction made in phonemic theory between segmental and prosodic phenomena is due to the Ancient Romans who would represent certain speech phenomena by letters, whereas they left others unrepresented. The first are called segmental, the latter prosodic. Mrs. Whitley's demonstration is just one more piece of evidence in favour of my theory which holds that phonemic theory is a consequence of the invention of alphabetic writing and subsequent development of it by Greek and Roman philosophers.